

**TWELFTH KERALA LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY**

**COMMITTEE  
ON  
PUBLIC ACCOUNTS  
(2008-2011)**

**NINETY FIRST REPORT**

(Presented on 29th June, 2009)



**SECRETARIAT OF THE KERALA LEGISLATURE  
THIRUVANANTHAPURAM  
2009**

TWELFTH KERALA LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY

**COMMITTEE  
ON  
PUBLIC ACCOUNTS  
(2008-2011)**

**NINETY FIRST REPORT**

**On**

**Action taken by Government on the Recommendations contained  
in the Seventy Fifth Report of the Committee on  
Public Accounts (1993-1995)**

## CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
Composition of the Committee	.. v
Introduction	.. vii
Report	.. 1
Appendix :	
G.O.(Rt.) No. 1377/93/Irrn. dt. 22-12-1993	.. 6

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC ACCOUNTS (2008-2011)

*Chairman :*

Shri Aryadan Muhammed

*Members :*

Shri C. T. Ahammed Ali

” Anathalavattom Anandan

” Babu Paul

” K. C. Joseph

” K. M. Mani

” A. C. Moideen

” M. Prakashan Master

” Ramachandran Kadannappally

Smt. K. K. Shylaja Teacher

Shri M. V. Sreyams Kumar

*Legislature Secretariat :*

Shri P. D. Rajan, Secretary

Smt. V. Jayalekshmi Amma, Additional Secretary

Shri Wilson V. John, Deputy Secretary

Smt. A. Achamma, Under Secretary

## INTRODUCTION

I, the Chairman, Committee on Public Accounts, having been authorised by the Committee to present this Report on their behalf, present the Ninety First Report on Action Taken by Government on the Recommendations contained in the Seventy Fifth Report of the Committee on Public Accounts (1993-1995)

The Committee considered and finalised this Report at the meeting held on 10th June, 2009.

Thiruvananthapuram,  
29th June, 2009.

ARYADAN MUHAMMED,  
*Chairman,*  
*Committee on Public Accounts.*

## **REPORT**

This Report deals with the action taken by Government on the recommendations contained in the 75<sup>th</sup> Report of the Committee on Public Accounts (1993-95).

The 75<sup>th</sup> Report of the Committee on Public Accounts (1993-95) was presented to the House on March 22, 1994 and it contained nine recommendations relating to Irrigation Department. Government were addressed to furnish the action taken statements on the recommendations contained in the report on 16<sup>th</sup> May 1994 and the final reply was received on 11-4-2008.

The Committee examined the replies at its meetings held on 7-8-2002 and 22-9-2008 and decided not to pursue further action in the light of the replies furnished by Government. The recommendations of the Committee and the statements of Action Taken by Government are incorporated in this Report.

### **Recommendations of the Committee and the Replies Furnished by the Government**

#### **WATER RESOURCES DEPARTMENT**

##### **Recommendation**

*(Sl.No.1 Para No.10)*

1.1 The Committee observe that a detailed survey on the availability of water had not been conducted before taking the decision to increase the ayacut area of the Pamba Irrigation Project from the original 13,000 Hectares to 20,000 Hectares.

##### **Action Taken**

1.2 Most of the additional ayacut areas are garden land and the water requirement for the crops in these lands are less than that of wet crops, the additional requirement can be met resorting to run off and therefore the detailed survey on the availability of water was not undertaken.

##### **Recommendation**

*(Sl.No.2 Para No.11)*

1.3 The Committee also observe that the joint verification of the extent of area brought under irrigation has not yet been completed and as a result there is no realistic data on the benefits derived from the Project.

### **Action Taken**

1.4 Joint verification of ayacut areas of the PIP was taken up during the last two years. The joint verification has been completed in Ranni, Kozhencheri and Karthikappally Taluk except in Ranni Village which belongs to Ranni Taluk. In Chengannur Taluk joint verification is done partially in five villages. The ayacut areas lying in Thottappuzhasseri, Koyippuram and Eraviperoor villages of Thiruvalla Taluk and areas lying in Puramattom village of Mallappally Taluk were already finalized for collecting Irrigation cess. Joint verification was conducted in the ayacut areas lying in Pandanades, Puliyoor, Mulakkuzha Ala and Venmani villages also and an area of 555.39 ha. was fixed for collecting Irrigation cess. In the ayacut areas lying in Mavelikkara Taluk, joint verification was done partially.

1.5 Out of the 21135 hectares of total ayacut areas of PIP, joint verification has been completed in the major portion. But the report with connected documents is not completely obtained from revenue authorities. Documents fixing ayacut areas and irrigation cess have been obtained from various villages of Ranni Taluk for a total area of 4709.81 ha. The Assistant Executive Engineers have been directed to obtain such records from other taluks also. Joint verification under the areas of PIP Sub Division, Kozhencheri is completely over. The joint verification has not been completed in the other two sub division (ie. CAD Sub Division, Chengannur and CAD Sub Division Mavelikkara). This will be completed soon subject to the participation of revenue functionaries.

### **Recommendation**

*(Sl.No.3 Para No.12)*

1.6 The Project is intended to provide irrigation facility to paddy fields with projected additional production of 81,650 tonnes of paddy per year. But in reality the additional production never exceeded 28,802 tonnes and it was as low as 10,568 tonnes in some crop cutting experiments. This additional production is in no way remunerative compared to the expenses on the project.

### **Action Taken**

1.7 Farmers reluctant to take up Paddy cultivation because of higher costs and low profitability. Lot of paddy fields are being filled up and converted into dry land and these aspects affect the paddy production and shortfall in projected target.

**Recommendation**

*(Sl.No.4 Para No.13)*

1.8 The Committee also note that as a result of the non completion of the verification of the actual area brought under irrigation, levy of water cess which is the main source of returns on the capital outlay, is not being assessed and levied except in case of a very small area of the irrigated land.

**Action Taken**

1.9 Necessary instructions were issued to the Assistant Executive Engineers concerned to complete the balance work of joint verification and to finalise the ayacut area list. The joint verification is in progress and area list will be prepared in consultation with the Revenue Authorities.

**Recommendation**

*(Sl.No.5 Para No.14)*

1.10 The Committee observe that because of defects in the construction of elevated canals, large tracts of paddy fields have been rendered water logged.

**Action Taken**

1.11 Inadequate drainage facilities and leakage of canal causes water logging to paddy fields. Due to the paucity of funds, rectification works have not been carried out effectively. Reclamation works under CADA scheme were carried out for minimizing water logging.

**Recommendation**

*(Sl.No.6 Para No.15)*

1.12 The Committee recommend that the verification of the extent of area actually benefited from the project should be completed without further delay and water cess levied and collected.

**Action Taken**

1.13 Along with the joint verification itself, the verification of the extent of actually benefited area is also done. In fact those areas selected and fixed for irrigation cess are actually benefited areas. Co-ordination of both Irrigation and Revenue Departments is essential for completing the joint verification of the remaining areas. Instructions have been issued to the departmental officers to complete the balance work of joint verification of ayacut and to finalise the area of ayacut list.

**Recommendation**

*(Sl. No. 7 Para No. 16)*

1.14 The Committee also recommend that immediate measures should be taken to reclaim the paddy fields, which are now water logged because of defects in the elevated canals.

**Action Taken**

1.15 Directions have been given to the Chief Engineer, to take steps for the rectification of the defective elevated canals.

**Recommendation**

*(Sl. No. 8 Para No. 17)*

1.16 The enquiry into the lapses in the construction of the aqueduct in the Vallamkulam branch canal should be completed immediately and the committee should be intimated of the actions taken against the officials responsible for the lapses.

**Action Taken**

1.17 There were 7 officers involved in this case. Five of these officers, Shri K.G. Gopalakrishna Panicker, Assistant Engineer, Shri T. K. Thomas, Assistant Executive Engineer, Shri N. V. Somasekharan Nair, Assistant Engineer, Shri T. Thomas, Assistant Engineer and Shri M. Ramachandran Nair, Work Superintendent were charge sheeted by the Chief Engineer, Irrigation & Administration. Later the Chief Engineer, Irrigation & Administration Thiruvananthapuram vide order No. Irrgn.Vig.3-3276/88 dated 5-10-2000 has absolved these five officers and finalized the disciplinary action against them.

1.18 Two officers, Shri. T.A Abdulla, Assistant Executive Engineer and Shri K.K. Philip, Executive Engineer were charge sheeted by Government. Later, disciplinary action against these officers was dropped as per G.O.(Rt)No.1377/93/Irrgn. Dated 22-12-1993 (copy enclosed).

**Recommendation**

*(Sl. No. 9 Para No. 18)*

1.19 The position with regard to the adjustment of the excess advance paid to the Kerala State Construction Corporation should be intimated to the Committee.

**Action Taken**

1.20 The net amount due to the department on account of excess advance paid to Kerala State Construction Corporation Limited comes to Rs. 1,83,327. The final bill of the work entrusted with the Kerala State Construction Corporation Limited is still pending settlement.

Thiruvananthapuram,  
29th June, 2009.

ARYADAN MUHAMMED,  
*Chairman,*  
*Committee on Public Accounts.*

## APPENDIX

**GOVERNMENT OF KERALA****Abstract**

IRRIGATION DEPARTMENT—ESTABLISHMENT—PIP—ACCIDENT AT VALLAMKULAM COLLAPSE OF 3 SPANS OF AQUEDUCT—DISCIPLINARY ACTION AGAINST SHRI K. K. PHILIP (SUPERINTENDING ENGINEER RETD) AND SHRI T. A. ABDULLA (SUPERINTENDING ENGINEER RETD)—FINALISED— ORDERS ISSUED

---



---

**IRRIGATION (A) DEPARTMENT**

G. O.(Rt) No. 1377/93/Irrn.

Dated, Thiruvananthapuram, 22-12-1993.

- Read:*—
1. Memo of charges No. 53000/F3/90/PW & T dated 1-8-1990
  2. Written statement of defence dated, 24-9-1990 submitted by Shri K. K. Philip
  3. Letter No. Vig. 9/3276/88 dated, 2-8-1991 from the Chief Engineer, Irrn. & Admn.
  4. Letter No. B1. 1987/87 dated, 11-10-1990 from Shri T. A. Abdulla, Executive Engineer, P.W.D. Roads Division, Kottayam
  5. Letter No. Vig. 9/3276/88/dated, 5-9-1993 and 29-7-1993 from Chief Engineer, Irrn. & Admn.

**ORDER**

In 1987, three spans of aqueduct at Vallamkulam in the PIP (Pamba Irrigation Project) collapsed . The F.I.W conducted an enquiry into the matter and reported that the failure of the aqueduct was due the faulty design and execution. The Chief Technical Examiner recommended action against the officers who recorded false measurements of foundation and piers. After examining the CTE's report Government directed the Chief Engineer to take action against the field staff also who failed to take vigilant action for protection of the aqueduct. The following officers were found responsible in this case.

- |  |   |                 |
|--|---|-----------------|
| <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Shri T. A. Abdulla, the then Executive Engineer</li> <li>2. Shri Gopalakrishna Panicker, the then Asst. Engineer</li> <li>3. Shri T. K. Thomas, Assistant Exe. Engineer</li> </ol> | } | Executive Staff |
|--|---|-----------------|

- |  |               |
|--|---------------|
| <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>4. Shri T. Thomas , Assistant Engineer</li> <li>5. Shri N. V. Somasekharan Nair, Assistant Engineer</li> <li>6. Shri M. Ramachandran Nair</li> <li>7. Shri K. K. Philip, the then Executive Engineer</li> </ol> | } Field Staff |
|--|---------------|

The Chief Engineer has initiated action against all the officers except against S/Shri T. A. Abdulla and K. K. Philip

Shri T. A. Abdulla, the then Asst. Executive Engineer and Shri K. K. Philip, the then Executive Engineer (since retired as Superintending Engineers) were charge sheeted by Government as per Memo of charges and statement of allegations read as first paper framing the following charges.

*Charges against Shri K. K. Philip*

“You have failed to take precautionary measures to protect the pier No. 11 of Vallamkulam aqueduct of Pampa Irrigation Project due to which it fell down and thus earned loss to Government.

In his reply to the memo of charges and statement of allegations read as second paper Shri K. K. Philip denied the allegations. He has argued that the aqueduct being a permanent RCC structure requires no structural and foundational inspections for years and that the collapse may be due to the earth quake on 12-1-1987. There was no water in the aqueduct. Water was let through the aqueduct on 22-11-1987 and it collapsed on 28-1-1987. No detailed in the foundation or structure were brought to his notices by the subordinate officers. There was no regular schedule of inspection and the collapse was not due to any scouring of the foundation. He was not involved in the construction or maintenance of the aqueduct.

The written statement of defence submitted by Shri K. K. Philip (SE Retired) was examined with reference to the connected records and the remarks offered by Chief Engineer (Irrigation and Administration). He was also heard the person.

The Chief Engineer has remarked that the collapse of the structure was mainly due to faulty design and execution. The F.I.W has reported that the failure was a result of settlement due to erosion of soil below the pier No. 11. In the case of permanent RCC structures like aqueduct, proper care should have been taken at the design stage itself to safe-guard such erosion contingencies. This was not done at the time of designing the structure.

The CTE has also remarked that although the mishap would have been averted if the maintenance staff were more vigilant in as it would not be proved beyond doubt that the sinking of the pier was going on over the years on whether the collapse was sudden the benefit of doubt be given to the officer.

Government have examined the matter in detail and accept the views offered by the Chief Engineer and CTS in the matter and accordingly drop further action against Shri K. K. Philip (Superintending Engineer retired).

*Charges against Shri T. A. Abdulla*

1. Check measured the false measurement to off the foundation and pier of Vallankulam aqueduct of PIP which collapsed subsequently entailing in loss to Government.

2. Failed to take a deeper foundation in respect of pier No. 11 of atleast to the depth of foundation of pier No. 12 at the time of execution.

In his reply to the memo of charges and statement of allegations read as fourth paper Shri T. A. Adulla denied the allegations. He has submitted that he has not check measured the foundations of the pier No. 9, 10, 11 and 12 since it was not done during his tenure as A.E.E.. The measurements and Check measurements are seen recorded checked on 3-7-1976. The foundation was also not taken during his tenure as Assistant Exe. Engineer.

The written statement of defence submitted by Shri. T. A. Abdulla (Superintending Engineer retired) was examined with reference to the connected records and the remarks offered by Chief Engineer (Irrigation and Administration).

The Chief Engineer in his letter read as fifth paper has recommended to accept the explanation and to drop further action against the accused officer. The CTE has also expressed the sums opinion.

Government have examined the issue in detail and are pleased to accept the opinions of the Chief Engineer and CTE in the matter and accordingly drop further action against Shri T. A. Abdulla (Superintending Engineer retired).

By Order of the Governor,

SUSAN MATHAI,  
*Joint Secretary,*  
*for Secretary to Government.*

To

Shri K. K. Philip, c/o Mrs. Elizebath Philip, Federal Bank Ltd. P.B. No. 5216, Nawaraji Hill, Road No. 19, Dongri, Bombay, Pin-400 009.

Shri T. A. Abdulla, Superintending Engineer, retired, Thuruthiyil House, Thottumugham, Alwaye.

The Chief Engineer , Irrigation and Administration, Thiruvananthapuram

The Chief Engineer, P. W. D. Administration, Trivandrum.

The Accountant General, A&E Trichur.

The Accountant General, A&E Thiruvananthapuram.

The Accountant General, Audit Thiruvananthapuram.

P.W.D. vide U.O. Note No. 53000/FS/89/PW & T. dt. 29-9-1992

S.F.

---

©  
Kerala Legislature Secretariat  
2009

KERALA NIYAMASABHA PRINTING PRESS